

St. John Fisher College

Fisher Digital Publications

Sport Management Undergraduate

Sport Management Department

Fall 2011

The Effectiveness of the NFL's Rooney Rule

Matthew Welker
St. John Fisher College

Follow this and additional works at: https://fisherpub.sjfc.edu/sport_undergrad



Part of the Sports Management Commons

[How has open access to Fisher Digital Publications benefited you?](#)

Recommended Citation

Welker, Matthew, "The Effectiveness of the NFL's Rooney Rule" (2011). *Sport Management Undergraduate*. Paper 25.

Please note that the Recommended Citation provides general citation information and may not be appropriate for your discipline. To receive help in creating a citation based on your discipline, please visit <http://libguides.sjfc.edu/citations>.

This document is posted at https://fisherpub.sjfc.edu/sport_undergrad/25 and is brought to you for free and open access by Fisher Digital Publications at St. John Fisher College. For more information, please contact fisherpub@sjfc.edu.

The Effectiveness of the NFL's Rooney Rule

Abstract

The Rooney Rule in the NFL was created in order to create an atmosphere of racial equality and fairness when relating to hiring practices. The general consensus on the Rooney Rule is that it has been successful so far, but there is still a lot to do in order to counteract racial bias when it comes to hiring employees. After nine years of validation, it is still yet to be seen if the Rooney Rule has made changes to the NFL. This research explores the positions of Offensive Coordinator, Defensive Coordinator, and General Manager in all 32 NFL franchises to determine if the implementation of the Rooney Rule has impacted the racial diversity of those holding the positions. The effectiveness of the Rooney Rule can be measured by not only the impact that the rule has had on positions that require an interview for minority candidates, but also the "trickledown" effect for those positions that do not require a minority candidate interview for a vacancy. Aspects of racism, reverse racism, and Title VII are used to contextualize the findings. Of the positions that were analyzed, only General Manager showed a significant increase in minority held positions.

Document Type

Undergraduate Project

Professor's Name

Emily Dane-Staples

Subject Categories

Sports Management

The Effectiveness of the NFL's Rooney Rule

Matthew Welker

St. John Fisher College

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

Abstract

The Rooney Rule in the NFL was created in order to create an atmosphere of racial equality and fairness when relating to hiring practices. The general consensus on the Rooney Rule is that it has been successful so far, but there is still a lot to do in order to counteract racial bias when it comes to hiring employees. After nine years of validation, it is still yet to be seen if the Rooney Rule has made changes to the NFL. This research explores the positions of Offensive Coordinator, Defensive Coordinator, and General Manager in all 32 NFL franchises to determine if the implementation of the Rooney Rule has impacted the racial diversity of those holding the positions. The effectiveness of the Rooney Rule can be measured by not only the impact that the rule has had on positions that require an interview for minority candidates, but also the “trickledown” effect for those positions that do not require a minority candidate interview for a vacancy. Aspects of racism, reverse racism, and Title VII are used to contextualize the findings. Of the positions that were analyzed, only General Manager showed a significant increase in minority held positions.

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

The Effectiveness of the NFL's Rooney Rule

In 1947, Jackie Robinson of the Brooklyn Dodgers broke the color barrier of Major League Baseball becoming the first African American athlete to play at the highest level of professional baseball in the United States in the modern era (Collins, 2007). Since that day, the world of sport has been a stage for the struggle for equality between races in America's work place (Collins, 2007). In the years since the integration of minority athletes onto the playing field of professional sport leagues, minority coaches and front office positions have slowly been filled by minority candidates (Madden, 2004). While leagues have made some progress towards integrating minority coaches and front office personnel in major professional sporting leagues, it is the opinion of many that there is still a long way to go (Goff & Tollison, 2009). One of the most controversial initiatives instated to promote the equality and advancement of minority candidates being considered for head coaching and football operations positions in the National Football League was the Rooney Rule (Collins, 2007).

Since the inception of the Rooney Rule in 2002, some experts say that the initiative has vastly improved the interview and hiring practices of the NFL (Madden & Ruther, 2010). Other parties however feel that the Rooney rule is a form of reverse racism and "tokenism", where the minority candidates are actually suffering from getting an interview for a position that they have no chance of obtaining (Maravent, 2006). This leads to the debate of whether or not the Rooney Rule has made advancements in the field of minority hiring, or if in fact there are some affirmative action consequences that arise by forcing NFL franchises to interview a minority candidate. This can also bring up the issue of whether or not the Rooney Rule has had a positive impact on the NFL since its inception in 2002 and what is the reason for the resulted consequence. Another result may indicate whether or not the Rooney Rule has any affirmative action implications in the form of reverse racism. Last, why is the NFL so slow in advancing in the field of minority hiring, when leagues like the NBA and MLB have made massive strides without any sort of forcing hiring practices (Kahn, 2004)?

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

Literature Review

The idea of racial equality in hiring practices of the NFL is an extremely important aspect of the way that the league not only runs, but also promotes itself as a global entity. The NFL has built itself as a global business with earning upwards of \$9 billion in revenue for the 2010 season. The way that the league presents itself not only to its consumers is extremely essential, but also the protection from class action law suits relating to affirmative action and minority discrimination is a huge issue (Collins, 2007). While other leagues have made strides in the field of minority hiring and equality, the NFL is still behind, in terms of percentages of minority head coaches and front office positions compared to other sports (Kahn, 2006). So in order to determine if NFL is on the right track to achieving a more diverse it is necessary to investigate the leagues initial diversity policy to see if it is effective. On the other hand, it is important to see if there are any sort of underlying affirmative action issues that may arise from teams holding interviews for minorities just to fill a quota, even if there is not actual intention of ever hiring the candidate (Goff & Tollison, 2009). Lastly, it is required to see if there are reasons that minority coaches are not hired while their white equals continue to be hired and retained at an overwhelming rate.

In 2004, a Lawrence Kahn study examined the retention factors of NBA coaches between 1996 and 2003. He looked at different factors such as record, race, pay, performance, and community value (Kahn, 2004). Kahn determined that there was very small statistical proof that differentiated race when determining retention of any coach. There have been studies, such as those done by Madden, that have indicated that minority coaches in the NFL have been on a "shorter leash" because of their skin color (Madden, 2004). This is just another example of how the NFL continues to struggle in terms of racial hiring and firing practices when relating to their coaches (Kahn, 2004) The NBA and the NFL have a similar percentage of minority players that make up their franchise. The NBA however, has a similar percentage of minority players compared to minority coaches as a part of their organizations. However,

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

the NFL, even though they have similar minority player percentages to the number of minority coaches, lack significantly in the percentages of minority coaches compared to minority players.

With the start of the new millennium, the NFL and the NBA were heading in two opposite directions in terms of minority hiring of head coaches (Collins, 2007). During the 2001-2002 seasons, 78 percent of the leagues players were African American but 48 percent of the head coaches were also African American. In comparison, the NFL's rosters were made up of 65 percent African American players, but only six percent of the coaches were minorities. This means that of the 32 head coaching positions, only two were held by African American coaches, even though the league's players made up well over half of the player population (Collins, 2007). While the coaching structure of the NFL is much more complex than the NBA, it seems that there was a clear cultural bias that was prevalent in the NFL that was not the same in its counterpart. In the NFL, there are an increased number of coaches who hold a much more significant amount of say in the overall game plan and execution of the game plan. This leads to a much greater amount of opportunities for power struggles within the coaching ranks to arise. Therefore, the connection of performance based incentives and job security based on performance should be much more prevalent in the landscape of assistant coaching jobs at the professional level. A Title VII Lawsuit would be extremely detrimental to the NFL because of not only the monetary loses that the league could face, but the publicity and potential lack of fans and overall revenue that could be lost if the NFL were to be ruled "racist" in a court of law (Collins, 2007). Overall in the NFL, there are more positional coaches then there are in either the NBA or MLB. For example, on NFL coaching staffs you will have a coach for each position such as quarterback coach, running back coach, wide receiver coach, and offensive line coach, along with head coordinators on each side of the football (offense and defense). However in the NBA and MLB, there are no positional based coaches such as point guard coach or short stop coach. There are only coaches who hold larger positions such as hitting coach or pitching coach. Along with that issue, there are most starting players and larger rosters

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

in the NFL. For each NFL roster there are 22 starters on offense and defense combined and a total of 53 players ("National Football League" n.d.). Usually MLB rosters have a total of 25 players total and the NBA consists approximately 15 players total (Kahn, 2004). These numbers should indicate that there should be more minority coaching opportunities based on the number of opportunities that are available.

Title VII is a section of the 1964 Civil Rights Act prohibits not only intentional discrimination, but also practices that have the effect of discriminating against individuals because of their race, color, national origin, religion, or sex ("Federal laws prohibiting Job Discrimination", 2009). This Act, among other legislation passed to protect different workers from different forms of discrimination, is protected by the EEOC or the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (Federal laws prohibiting Job Discrimination, 2009). When an individual feels that they have had either their personal rights violated or they have faced discrimination from an organization, that individual has two options in seeking action against the employers. The first option is for the discriminated individual to file a charge with the EEOC. Another option is to have any individual, group, or organization file a charge on the behalf of the individual or group that feels that they have been discriminated against. In the case of the NFL, Lawyers Johnnie Cochran and Cyrus Mehri threatened to file a Title VII lawsuit with the EEOC against the NFL which could have lead to a Federal Court Hearing. After a charge is filed, there are many different actions that the discriminatory organization can face ("Federal Laws Prohibiting", 2009).

There are multiple actions that the EEOC can use in order to both investigate and determine if an organization is worthy of bringing a lawsuit against in Federal Court ("Federal Laws Prohibiting", 2009). First, a charge and a "right to sue" notice from the EEOC can be delivered to an individual if the initial facts seem to warrant such action. Next, the EEOC can seek to settle the dispute without action if both sides are willing to enter a negotiation. Third, the EEOC can choose to investigate which could include anything from demanding documents, conducting interviews, review documents, and

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

investigate on site at a desired location. The last option would be for both parties to consent to mediation in which the EEOC would help both parties end their dispute confidentially. The EEOC resolves conflicts by either issuing a "right to sue" notice to the individual filing the complaint. This would give the discriminated individual 90 days to file a lawsuit against their employers. The two parties could also find a way to settle out of court through private meetings or mediation ("Federal Laws Prohibiting", 2009).

In 2002, a report by lawyer Johnnie Cochran and Cyrus Mehri detailed the leagues, "dismal record of minority hiring" (Collins, 2007, p. 885). The report contained 15 years of analysis and statistics that proved that the black coaches in the NFL often outperformed their white counterparts, yet minorities were still being hired at a less rapid pace and often faced quicker termination in the face of adversity (Collins, 2007, p. 883). These results are similar to the results found by Madden in 2004 and Madden with the help of Ruther in two separate studies on the success rate of African American coaches compared to their white equivalent (Madden, 2004). Cochran and Mehri's report ended with the call for a, "Fair Competition Resolution" for which incentives and punishments would be handed down for teams in their following of the racial hiring practices (Bell, 2003). Following the release of the report, Cochran and Mehri threatened to take action in the form of a class action lawsuit against the NFL unless, "substantial progress [was] made by the NFL in the hiring of African Americans for head coaching positions" (Collins, 2007, p. 887).

In response to the report and the threats by Cochran and Mehri, the league formed a committee named the NFL Committee on Workplace Diversity. This committee was chaired by the owner of the Pittsburgh Steelers, Dan Rooney (Madden, 2004). By December of 2002 the committee had drafted a series of mandates that promoted and endorsed diversity in both coaching and management. One specific mandate from the series was dubbed the "Rooney Rule" after the head of the committee. This policy required the interviewing of one minority candidate for head coaching and top football

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

operations positions. If these requirements were not met, the individual teams would be subject to punishment by the league's commissioner (Solow, Solow, and Walker, 2010). This mandate filled the requirement of Cochran and Mehri's, "Fair Competition Resolution" and they decided to not file an affirmative action lawsuit against the league. In addition, in order for the league to keep its word, the two lawyers formed a group called the Fritz Pollard Alliance, which was composed of former African American athletes, with the goal of promoting diversity in head coaching, football operation, and scouting hiring practice (Collins, 2007).

The Rooney Rule saw both early success and failure after its inception 2002. In the off-season after the rule was implemented, the Cincinnati Bengals hired their first African American coach in franchise history (Maravant, 2006). In this same year however, the only hiring that caused a team to get penalized happened with the hiring of Steve Mariucci as the new Head Coach of the Detroit Lions. After former Head Coach Marty Mornhinweg was fired in Detroit, rumors flew that Steve Mariucci was an almost "lock" to become the next head coach of the Lions (Maravant, 2006). However, because of the newest legislation from the NFL Committee on Workplace Diversity, the Lions were required to interview at least one minority candidate for the position. A few weeks after Mornhinweg was fired, Mariucci was introduced as the Lions new head coach. The NFL then proceeded to fine the franchise \$200,000 for failure to interview a minority candidate. The Lions owner and front office claimed that every minority candidate that they intended to interview withdrew their name from consideration because of the rumors that Mariucci was basically a lock to obtain the position (Maravant, 2006). This is where the idea of reverse racism and candidates being used as "tokens" becomes part of the conversation. If a team has no real intention of hiring a minority individual, yet goes through the motions of an interview, there is no good faith effort and the intent of the rule is being violated (Maravant, 2006). This case in 2002 has been the only such instance of a team being fined or punished

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

for failure to interview a minority for a Head Coaching opening since the implementation of the Rooney Rule.

Although this was the only formal violation, literature published after 2002 has not arrived at a consensus about the effectiveness of the rule. Those of whom support the regulation argue that without the Rooney Rule, minority candidates are at least getting the experience of interviewing for a head coaching position and getting an interview that they may not have received in the past (Brown, 2008). On the other hand, there is the field of thought that the forced interview is again a form of reverse racism and an affirmative action issue (Maravent, 2008). There is information that suggests that even before the implementation of the Rooney Rule, African American coaches in the NFL outperformed the white coaches in the league in terms of regular season success. There is also analysis that demonstrates that after the Rooney Rule was implemented, African American coaches have also been able to now outperform the white coaches in the league by a substantial margin (Madden, 2004; Madden & Ruther, 2010).

The first study by Madden showed that the small portion of head coaches that were African American outperformed their white equals in terms of regular season success. While the number of head coaches that were minorities were significantly smaller, only four out of 32 in 2004, the average regular season win percentage of the four was higher than that of the other white head coaches. Madden uses these percentages to show that minority head coaches deserve more chances to lead NFL teams in the future (Madden, 2004). The second study by Madden and Ruther showed that the success of the minority coaches continued since the implementation of the Rooney Rule with the minority coaches still out performing their white counterparts in overall regular season win percentage. The study also included playoff win percentages in which the African American coaches showed significant success. This success included the first time in which two minority coaches met in Super Bowl 41 with the Indianapolis Colts and Tony Dungy beating the Chicago Bears. Madden and Ruther again showed

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

information that minority coaches not only deserved more chances to lead teams, but proved once they are given that chance, they are successful (Madden & Ruther, 2010).

Maravent believes that the Rooney Rule is strictly an affirmative action policy that creates a safeguard for the NFL against class action lawsuits, similar to the one that Cochran and Mehri threatened pre-regulation. Maravent is a lawyer who represents labor organizations and union rights issues (2006). He uses the example of Coach Nick Saban and the Miami Dolphins. It was well known around the league that the Dolphins wanted Nick Saban to be their head coach for the 2005 season before any other coaches had even been interviewed. But, because of the new Rooney Rule, the Dolphins had to not only interview five potential candidates, but one of those had to be a minority (Maravent, 2006). So the Dolphins were forced to bring in a head coaching candidate, whom they had no intention of hiring, for the sole purpose of filling their minority quota. Maravent views this as racism because the Dolphins, in a sense, used Art Shell solely for the color of his skin and not his merit as a coaching candidate. He also suggests the rule be applied to the front office hiring practices of NFL franchises, which since the release of his review has been adapted by the league (Brown, 2008). Maravent believed that if the rate of minority head coaches rose in the NFL, that the number of minority candidates should also increase within the front office because those positions also directly relate to the success of the football team on the field.

Solow, Solow, and Walker (2010) also chose to explore the effects of the Rooney Rule. Their article analyzes assistant coaches in the NFL from 1970 to 2009 to determine if race had anything to do with their promotion. The results of the article were that instead of race, that skill, qualification, and track record were more of a measuring stick than that of candidate's race (Solow et. all, 2010). The authors also suggest that as the league has progressed with the implementation of the Rooney Rule, so has the diversity of assistant coaches and intern the number of minority candidates that are receiving chances to prove themselves on the head coaching level. The authors also look at how young assistant

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

coaches are now often times groomed to be head coaches in waiting instead of older head coaches taking over after years of experience coaching in the league.

Another piece of literature that explores race and ethnicity in the NFL is by Senggirbay in which he discusses some of the different aspects of racial discrimination throughout the world and indirectly, the workplace. The piece that relates the most to the NFL would be the discussion of Conflict Theory and how different races react in different situations (Senggirbay, 2011). Senggirbay describes that when relating to social structure, or in this case the workplace, when there is a scarcity of a resource one group will become dominant in the situation to control the resource. This leads the dominant group to use the power that it has established in order to maintain its privilege within the certain situation. The last step is that the group in power legitimates their powers with a system of powers that establishes their dominance (Senggirbay, 2011).

This Conflict Theory has a direct relationship to what has been established in the NFL over the past 40 years. With the NFL being made up of 32 different franchises, there are a limited number of positions that can be filled in terms of coaches and front office positions. When the NFL was formed, the majority of coaches and front office workers were white males. This made it possible for white males to set the standard and dominate and continue to hire within their own racial and sexual demographics when new openings came up within the different organizations. This has allowed white males to continue to set up a system that leads for white males to be hired into openings and minorities to have to work harder in some cases in order to hire. We have seen this trend continue today with only seven out of 32 head coaches in the NFL being of African American race (King, Leonard, & Kusz, 2007).

The current research on the minority hiring practices in the NFL to date have laid the foundation that shows that minority coaches not only deserve a chance to be the face of an NFL franchise, but have also shown documented success that equals their white counterparts. The literature also shows the importance of equality in the hiring practices of the NFL, especially now with the NFL being a \$6 Billion

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

industry. The literature though does not review hires outside of the head coaching positions. This research looks at the number of offensive coordinators, defensive coordinators, and general managers at the implementation of the Rooney Rule and currently in the NFL to determine if a real change in hiring's have occurred. The main questions are if there

1. Has there been a change in the number of minority assistant coaches and general managers that hold positions in the nine years since implementation of the Rooney Rule?
2. Is there a significant difference in the number of minorities in that hold coordinator positions and General Manager positions as a part of the data? If there is, why are these differences present in the overall number of positions held?

Method

There is a gap in research when relating to both the hiring of coordinators and front office personal that are minorities within the NFL. There have been different pieces of literature that demonstrate the different reasons behind the lack of minority hires among NFL Head Coaches (Collins, 2007). This group of 32 employees however is only a small group of employees that impacts the NFL. While these 32 men are the ones who are most often in the spot light behind star players, the work of not only the front office members, but also the coordinators who have a huge impact on the actual product that is on the field on Sundays.

Sample Selection

All thirty-two NFL teams were used in this research project. As previous research has explored the racial diversity of head coaches (Collins, 2007????), this research will use the positions of OC, DC, GM for analysis. Although the Rooney Rule does not require minority candidate interview for this population, Offensive and Defensive Coordinators can be the difference between winning or losing a game through game planning and game day execution. The general manager position is now required to interview a minority candidate, but there have been no studies to determine if there have been

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

improvements made to the racial diversity of the front office since the implementation of the Rooney rule.

Data Collection Procedure

Data collection was done from two different databases in order to find the personnel that were on the pay roll of the 32 organizations in 2002 and also 2011. NFL teams only list their current staff as a part of their team website so www.pro-football-reference.com was used in order to secure the three positions to be analyzed from 2002. www.pro-football-reference.com is a database of statistics, and personnel from each team as compiled by a mathematician and sports fans in an attempt to compile the most diverse collection of football statistics available today. This website has been used as a part of multiple scholarly articles relating to the Rooney Rule as a way to look back at what coaches held different positions at specific points in time (Madden, 2004)

The current information was secured from www.nfl.com via each franchises team page. Most of the coaching staffs had their own link, while the General Managers were found on the front office link, for almost every case. This allowed for the acquisition of all of the information used to analyze the effectiveness of the Rooney Rule since its implementation.

Data Analysis

After the compilation of the numbers, the numbers were entered into SPSS Statistics program for analysis. White coaches and General Managers were entered as the number one to represent their grouping. African American coaches and General Managers were entered in as the number two to represent their group. The lone Hispanic coach, Ron Rivera, was entered in as the number three. For all positions not reporting either a coordinator or a General Manager, the number four was entered. This

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

allowed for the creation of tables that analyzed the number of coaches and General Managers within the two sets of Data.

Originally, the percentage of minority coaches and General Managers among those positions listed was going to be computed into a percentage in order to compare against its corresponding data set. However, with there being 13 positions that did not report and with the number of non-reporting franchises being different for every data set, only the pure number of minority positions holders were used for analysis.

Results

Despite using sample that has only spanned over a short period of time, there is evidence that the Rooney Rule has been effective since its inception. For the offensive coordinator position in 2002, there were zero positions that were filled by minority coaches. Of the 28 teams that listed coaches for their offensive coordinator position, all 28 of them were held by white employees (see Appendix A). This is evidence of the reason that there was a legitimate Title VII issue in relating the hiring practices of NFL franchises. In 2011 all but one franchise listed an offensive coordinator but only one out of the 31 listed was a minority. Only Curtis Modkins of the Buffalo Bills was a minority candidate making only one out of 31 of the leagues' offensive coordinators being minorities. While this is technically an improvement from zero to one, it is difficult to justify an actual improvement because the ratio of white to minority offensive coordinators is so low. Also it is difficult to justify a significant improvement because in 2002 the leagues total of minority offensive coordinators was zero and an improvement to one is not significant.

Defensive coordinators were the most diverse position of the three that were analyzed. In 2002, seven out of the 29 coordinators that were listed by their franchises were of African American ethnicity. (Appendix B). In 2011, there were also seven minority defensive coordinators in the league

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

with six being African American and one being of Hispanic descent. However, only one team did not list a defensive coordinator so while the actual number of minority defensive coordinators stayed the same, there were more coaches being reported so the number in essence is worse in the present day in terms of percentage (Appendix B).

In terms of the General Manager position of the 32 NFL franchises, in 2002, one of out the 28 positions were filled by a minority employee. This shows why the head of football operations was included as a part of the Rooney Rule's original target in change. In 2011, there was a significant increase in minority General Managers with out of the 31 positions filled, four being held by minorities. This equates to the only group of data that was analyzed to show any significant signs of improvement after the implementation of the Rooney Rule (Appendix C)

Discussion

It is clear that there has not been must progress made in the field of offensive and defensive coordinators since the Rooney Rule was implemented in 2002. In fact, the percentage of defensive coordinators that are minorities has actually gone down. The only real head way that has been made has been in the General Manager position. This could be attributed to the fact that minority candidates must be interviewed for each General Manger opening that is available (Collins, 2007). Until the mandatory minority interview is made a league wide policies for all positions, there still could be no change to the number of minorities that are hired. Overall, the has been no real impact that has been made outside of the Head Coaching and General Manager positions as created by the Rooney Rule.

At this point, it is unclear whether or not reverse racism is evident within the interview process of NFL coordinator and General Manager vacancies during this day and age. In order for that to be determined, an in depth analysis of the interview process, as well as inside information from the people both interviewing and hiring prospective candidates would have to be interviewed. What can be assumed though is that since the policy of required minority interviews has been implemented at some

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

positions, those positions have seen an increase in minority hires. On the other hand, positions that do not required interviews of minority candidates have made no progress towards equality. Whether this change in the required interview positions is because of those forced interviews or the qualifications of those applicants that are attempting to be hired, would require more inside information. In terms of Tokenism, again, only the group of people holding the interviews will know if the minority candidate is being actually considered or if they are only being interviewed as a part of the color of their skin. It cannot be analyzed to this point without any further information.

In terms of conflict theory, it seems that the NFL is slowly but surely making progress towards eliminating their discriminatory practices among at least some leadership positions. Previous works, like that done by Madden and Maravant, have shown that minority head coaches are getting more opportunities. Also, data from www.pro-football-reference.com has shown that General Managers are also getting more opportunities among minority candidates. With Head Coaches and General Managers being perhaps the most influential positions outside of the owners role, this is a good sign for the NFL in terms of resolving their conflict as a part of the conflict theory.

Limitations and Future Research

With the Rooney Rule being established only nine years ago, there is a limited sample size that can be viewed at this point in time. As the years go by, there will be more years to look at and it is possible that as the years go on, the NFL will continue its trend of hiring minority Head Coaches and General Managers and it will translate into other positions such as coordinators and other front office positions. This research is also limited because it is impossible to know how the hiring process was held for the different positions that came open since the Rooney Rule was implemented. There may have been minority candidates that were interviewed for certain positions but just did not gain them because their counterparts were more qualified or a better fit for the organization. Also, even if there was a rule

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

that a minority must be interviewed with each opening, it is no guarantee that they will secure more jobs just because an opportunity to interview is forced on the NFL franchise. Last, there is no certainty that if the NFL makes it necessary to interview minority candidates for all of their football related openings, there is still no guarantee that the number of employees will rise.

As the NFL and their hiring practices continue to evolve, so will the number of minority candidates that are available for positions of importance. Since the Rooney Rule was only implemented 9 years ago, there is a small sample size of potential change. While the offensive and defensive coordinator positions have had change over at almost every available position, there has not been much change (Appendix 1,2). However, the change that is evident at the General Manager position is realistic despite a much lesser rate of turn over (Appendix 3). Future research will have a larger sample size as well as more turn over to see if there have been improvements in terms of the pure number of minorities that hold positions among coordinators and General Managers. Future research could also analyze other coaching positions or positions in the front office if the information can be secured.

Overall the Rooney Rule was implemented in order to improve the minority hiring practices within the NFL. On a small scale, it has been successful in what it originally set out to do. By requiring minority candidates are hired for both Head Coaching and General Manager position openings, a rise in minority job holders has increased. However, outside of that scope, it is clear, at least on the football side of the franchise, that there has been no head way made in terms of increased chances for minorities. Unless there is a trickledown effect that can be seen from the Head Coaching and General Manager positions, so other positions on the field and in the front office, the NFL could again find themselves open to an Affirmative Action law suit as a part of Title VII. While the NFL has had a good start on improving minority hiring practices within the last 9 years, there is still much that can be done to bring a \$9 billion industry closer to equality in the workplace.

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

References

- Bell, J. (2003, March 20). Watchdog group wants NFL's hiring efforts to cover all jobs. *USA Today*, pp. C3.
- Brown, C. (2008, February 18) The colorblind hires are the best ones. *The Sporting News*, 232(7), 44-45
- Collins, B. W. (2007). Tackling unconscious bias: The plight of the Rooney Rule. *New York University Law Review*, 82(3), 870-912
- Goff, B., L., & Tollison, R. D. (2009) Racial integration of coaching evidence from the NFL. *Journal of Sport Economics*, 10(2), 127-140
- Madden, J. F. (2004) Differences in the success of NFL coaches by race, 1990-2002, evidence of last hire. last fire. *Journal of Sports Economics*, 5(1), 6-19
- Madden, J. F., & Ruther, M. (2010) Has the NFL's Rooney rule efforts "leveled the field" for African American head coaching candidates. *Journal of Sports Economics*, 12(1), 1-16
- Maravent, B. (2006). Is the Rooney Rule affirmative action? Analyzing the NFL's mandate to its clubs regarding coaching and front office hires. *Sports Lawyers Journal*, 13(1), 233-273
- Kahn, L. M. (2004) Race, performance, pay, and retention among National Basketball Association head coaches. *Journal of Sports Economics*, 7(2), 119-149
- King, C., Leonard, D. J., & Kusz, K. W. (2007). White power and sport. *Journal of sport & social Issues*, 31(1), 3-10
- Kooistra, P., Mahoney, J. S., & Bridges, L. (1993) The unequal opportunity of equal ability hypothesis: Racism in the National Football League. *Sociology of Sport Journal*, 10(3), 241-255
- Senggirbay, M. (2011). Main approaches to the definition of ethnic conflict. *International journal of Academic Research*, 3(1), 889-892
- Solow, B., Solow, J. L., & Walker, T. B. (2010). The Rooney rule and minority hiring in the NFL. *Labour Economics*, 1-6.

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

(2009, November 21) *Federal laws prohibiting Job Discrimination*. Retrieved From

<http://www.eeoc.gov/facts/qanda.html>

(2010, September 29) *Forbes Franchise Values*. Retrieved from

<http://espn.go.com/sportsbusiness/s/forbes.html>

(2011) *Pro-Football Reference*. Retrieved from

[http:// http://www.pro-football-reference.com/](http://http://www.pro-football-reference.com/)

(2011) *National Football League Website*. Retrieved from

<http://www.nfl.com>

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

Appendix A - Table of Contents – Offensive Coordinators

TEAM	Offensive Coordinator 2002	Offensive Coordinator 2011
Arizona Cardinals	Rich Olson (W)	Mike Miller (W)
Atlanta Falcons	None Listed	Mike Mularky (W)
Baltimore Ravens	None Listed	Cam Cameron (W)
Buffalo Bills	Kevin Gilbride (W)	Curtis Modkins (B)
Carolina Panthers	Dan Henning (W)	Rob Chudzinski (W)
Chicago Bears	John Shoop (W)	Mike Martz (W)
Cincinnati Bengals	Bob Bratkowski (W)	Jay Gruden (W)
Cleveland Browns	Bruce Arians (W)	Pat Shurmur (W)
Dallas Cowboys	Bruce Coslett (W)	None Listed
Denver Broncos	Gary Kubiack (W)	Dennis Allen (W)
Detroit Lions	None Listed	Scott Linehan (W)
Green Bay Packers	Tom Rossley (W)	Joe Philbin (W)
Houston Texans	Chris Palmer (W)	Rick Dennison (W)
Indianapolis Colts	None Listed	Clyde Christiansen (W)
Jacksonville Jaguars	Tony Sparano (W)	Dirk Koetter (W)
Kansas City Chiefs	Al Saunders (W)	Bill Muir (W)
Miami Dolphins	Norv Turner (W)	Brian Daboll (W)
Minnesota Vikings	Scott Linehan (W)	Bill Musgrave (W)
New England Patriots	Charlie Weis (W)	Bill O'Brien (W)
New Orleans Saints	Mike McCarthy (W)	Pat Carmichael (W)
New York Jets	Paul Hackett (W)	Brian Schottenheimer (W)
Oakland Raiders	Marc Trestman (W)	Al Saunders (W)
Philadelphia Eagles	Brad Childress (W)	Marty Mornhinweg (W)
Pittsburgh Steelers	Mike Mularky (W)	Bruce Arians (W)
San Diego Chargers	Cam Cameron (W)	Clarence Shelmon (W)
San Francisco 49ers	Greg Knapp (W)	Greg Roman (W)
Seattle Seahawks	Gil Haskell (W)	Darrell Bevell (W)
Tampa Bay Buccaneers	Bill Muir (W)	Greg Olsen (W)
Tennessee Titans	Mike Heimerdinger (W)	Chris Palmer (W)
Washington Redskins	Steve Spurrier (W)	Kyle Shanahan (W)

Note. Letter in parenthesis stands for minority status (W) = White (B) = Black (H) = Hispanic

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

Appendix B – Table of Contents Defensive Coordinator

TEAM	Defensive Coordinator 2002	Defensive Coordinator 2011
Arizona Cardinals	Larry Marmie (W)	Ray Horton (B)
Atlanta Falcons	Wade Phillips (W)	Brian Van Gorder (W)
Baltimore Ravens	Mike Nolan (W)	Chuck Pagano (W)
Buffalo Bills	Jerry Gray (B)	George Edwards (B)
Carolina Panthers	Jack Del Rio (W)	Sean McDermott (W)
Chicago Bears	Greg Blache (B)	Rod Marinelli (W)
Cincinnati Bengals	Mark Dufner (W)	Mike Zimmer (W)
Cleveland Browns	Foge Fazio (W)	Dick Jauron (W)
Dallas Cowboys	Mike Zimmer (W)	Rob Ryan (W)
Denver Broncos	Ray Rhodes (B)	Mike McCoy (W)
Detroit Lions	Kurt Schottenheimer (W)	Gunther Cunningham (W)
Green Bay Packers	Ed Donatell (W)	Dom Capers (W)
Houston Texans	Vic Fangio (W)	Wade Phillips (W)
Indianapolis Colts	Ron Meeks (B)	Larry Coyer (W)
Jacksonville Jaguars	John Pease (W)	Mel Tucker (B)
Kansas City Chiefs	None Listed	Romeo Crennel (B)
Miami Dolphins	Jim Bates (W)	Mike Nolan (W)
Minnesota Vikings	Willie Shaw (B)	Fred Pagac (W)
New England Patriots	Romeo Crennel (B)	None Listed
New Orleans Saints	Rick Venturi (W)	Gregg Williams (W)
New York Jets	None Listed	Mike Pettine (W)
Oakland Raiders	Chuck Bresnahan (W)	Chuck Bresnahan (W)
Philadelphia Eagles	Jim Johnson (W)	Juan Castillo (H)
Pittsburgh Steelers	Bill Cowher (W)	Dick LeBeau (W)
San Diego Chargers	Dale Lindsey (W)	Greg Manusky (W)
San Francisco 49ers	Jim Mora (W)	Vic Fangino (W)
Seattle Seahawks	Steve Sidwell (W)	Gus Bradley (W)
Tampa Bay Buccaneers	Monte Kiffin (W)	None Listed
Tennessee Titans	Jim Schwartz (W)	Jerry Gray (W)
Washington Redskins	Marvin Lewis (B)	Jim Haslett (W)

Note. Letter in parenthesis stands for minority status (W) = White (B) = Black (H) = Hispanic

THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE'S ROONEY RULE

Appendix C – Table of Contents General Managers

TEAM	General Manager 2002	General Manager 2011
Arizona Cardinals	Bob Fergeson (W)	Rod Graves (B)
Atlanta Falcons	None Listed	Thomas Dimitroff (W)
Baltimore Ravens	Ozzie Newsome (B)	Ozzie Newsome (B)
Buffalo Bills	Tom Donahoe (W)	Buddy Nix (W)
Carolina Panthers	Marty Hurney (W)	Marty Hurney (W)
Chicago Bears	Jerry Angelo (W)	Jerry Angelo (W)
Cincinnati Bengals	None Listed	None Listed
Cleveland Browns	None Listed	Tom Heckert (W)
Dallas Cowboys	Jerry Jones (W)	Jerry Jones (W)
Denver Broncos	Ted Sundquist (W)	John Elway (W)
Detroit Lions	Matt Millen (W)	Martian Mayhew (B)
Green Bay Packers	Mike Sherman (W)	Ted Thompson (W)
Houston Texans	Charley Casserly (W)	Rick Smith (B)
Indianapolis Colts	Bill Polian (W)	Bill Polian (W)
Jacksonville Jaguars	None Listed	Paul Vance (W)
Kansas City Chiefs	Carl Peterson (W)	Scott Pioli (W)
Miami Dolphins	Rick Spielman (W)	Jeff Ireland (W)
Minnesota Vikings	Rob Brzezinski (W)	Rob Brzezinski (W)
New England Patriots	Scott Pioli (W)	Scott Pioli (W)
New Orleans Saints	Mickey Loomis (W)	Mickey Loomis (W)
New York Jets	Terry Bradway (W)	Mike Tannenbaum (W)
Oakland Raiders	Al Davis (W)	Al Davis (W)
Philadelphia Eagles	Tom Heckert (W)	Andy Reid (W)
Pittsburgh Steelers	Kevin Colbert (W)	Kevin Colbert (W)
San Diego Chargers	John Butler (W)	A.J. Smith (W)
San Francisco 49ers	Terry Donahue (W)	Trent Baalke
Seattle Seahawks	Mike Holmgren (W)	John Schneider (W)
Tampa Bay Buccaneers	Rich McKay (W)	Mark Dominik (W)
Tennessee Titans	Floyd Reese (W)	Lake Dawson (B)
Washington Redskins	Vinny Cerrato (W)	Bruce Allen (W)

Note. Letter in parenthesis stands for minority status (W) = White (B) = Black (H) = Hispanic

